# Compare Ontario returns to NY, CA, MA allowed returns on equity.

# CREATED BY: F PAMPUSH

# CREATED ON: 06-01-2024

# MODIFIED ON: 08-18-2024

# Key output: Annual average returns for electric utilities in Ontario,

# California, Massachusetts, New York. This file is written as

# a .csv for use in Excel

# Chart 1. Line plot of awarded ROEs for the particular states, 50 us states,

# Alberta & BC. Adjusted for taxes & leverage.

library(tidyverse)

library(readxl)

library(lubridate)

library(ggpubr)

# Color palette for plots.

colPalette <- c("#156082", "#E97132","#196B24", "#0F9ED5", "#A02B93",

"#4EA72E", "#E69F00", "#CC79A7")

# Load US and Canadian authorized return data downloaded from SNL

rDir<-"C:/Users/frank/OneDrive/Ontario Energy Board/R\_analysis/Rdata"

rawDir<-"C:/Users/frank/OneDrive/Ontario Energy Board/R\_analysis/Raw"

csvDir<-"C:/Users/frank/OneDrive/Ontario Energy Board/R\_analysis(final)/csvFiles"

# Load the SNL utility authorized return data.

load(paste(rDir,"usSNL.Rdata",sep="/"))

load(paste(rDir,"caSNL.Rdata",sep="/"))

# Load the interest rate data.

load(paste(rDir,"CA10.Rdata",sep="/"))

load(paste(rDir,"DGS.Rdata",sep="/"))

# Load the corporate tax rate data

cit<-read\_xlsx(path=paste(rawDir,"CorporateTaxRates.xlsx",sep="/"),

sheet="Corporate\_Tax\_Rates",skip=3)

names(cit)<-c("yrAuth","cait","usit")

# Clean the US data.

# Eliminate Limited Issue Riders

# Eliminate Illinois

# Authorized ROE>0.

# Electric cases

DERatioDeemed<-1.5

usfile2<-usfile%>%

mutate(ym1=as.POSIXct(ymd(paste(year(AuthDate),month(AuthDate),"01",sep="-"))))%>%

left\_join(cit,by="yrAuth")%>%

left\_join(DGS,by=c("AuthDate"="observation\_date"))%>%

left\_join(CA10,by=c("ym1"="observation\_date"))%>%

filter(!(state=="IL" & service=="Electric"),

reqROE>0,

AuthROE>0,

ReqEqRatio>0,

AuthERatio>0,

service=="Electric",

CaseType!="Limited-Issue Rider")%>%

# Create unlevered & relevered ROEs

mutate(authROE\_1=AuthROE/100,

authE2cap\_1=AuthERatio/100,

dgs10\_1=DGS10/100,

ca10\_1=CA10/100,

DERatio=(1/(authE2cap\_1))-1,

ROEU\_1=((authROE\_1+DERatio\*(1-usit)\*(dgs10\_1))/

(1+DERatio\*(1-usit))),

ROEU=ROEU\_1\*100,

#ROEL=100\*(ROEU\_1+DERatioDeemed\*(1-cait)\*(ROEU\_1-ca10\_1)))%>%

ROEL=100\*(ROEU\_1+DERatioDeemed\*(1-cait)\*(ROEU\_1-dgs10\_1)))%>%

# Simplifiy the file by removing unused columns

select(-company,-caseid,-rateChange,-reqRB,

-RateChange,-RBValMethod,-Lag,-Interim,

-Phase,-DecisionType,-RB2,-TestYrEnd,-uscitr)

# Create annualized Electric data by year, state, and casetype.

roeUS1\_yr<-usfile2%>%

filter(service=="Electric")%>%

group\_by(yr=yrAuth,state,CaseType)%>%

summarise(ROEA\_US=mean(AuthROE,na.rm=TRUE),

ROEAdj=mean(ROEL,na.rm=TRUE),

DE=mean(DERatio,na.rm=TRUE))%>%

ungroup()%>%

mutate(state\_case=paste(state,CaseType,sep="\_"))%>%

pivot\_longer(cols="ROEA\_US",values\_to="ROE")%>%

select(-name)

# Ontario awarded ROEs grouped by year

roeCA\_yr<-cafile%>%

group\_by(yr)%>%

summarise(ROE=100\*mean(ROE,na.rm=TRUE))%>%

ungroup()%>%

mutate(state\_case="Ontario\_Dist",

CaseType="Distribution",

state="Ontario",

ROEAdj=ROE)

roeCA\_yr<-roeCA\_yr[,c(1,5,4,6,3,2)]

roeCA\_yr<-roeCA\_yr%>%

mutate(DE=1.5)

# Combine roe files.

# This file is all US states + ontario by year and case type.

roe1\_yr<-rbind(roeUS1\_yr,roeCA\_yr)

# This file is the same as above except that it is \*only\* for

# the comps: NY, MA, CA, Ontario

roe\_yr\_comps<-roe1\_yr%>%

filter(state %in% c("NY","MA","CA","Ontario"))

# Save the two files in .csv format for excel

#write\_csv(roe1\_yr,file=paste(csvDir,"snl\_states\_yr.csv",sep="/"))

#write\_csv(roe\_yr\_comps,file=paste(csvDir,"snl\_comps.csv",sep="/"))

# Plot the 50 State & CA electric ROE data adjusted for leverage & taxes

plotData<-roe1\_yr%>%

filter(state %in% c("Ontario","NY","CA","MA"))

ggplot()+

geom\_line(data=roe1\_yr,aes(x=yr,y=ROEAdj,group=state),colour="grey34",alpha=.5)+

geom\_line(data=plotData,aes(x=yr,y=ROEAdj,group=state,colour=state),

linewidth=1.25)+

ylab("Percent")+

xlab("")+

theme\_bw()+

scale\_color\_manual(values=colPalette,labels=c("California","Massachusetts",

"New York",

"Ontario"))+

scale\_y\_continuous(labels = function(x) format(x, nsmall = 1),

limits=c(0,14))+

# geom\_segment(aes(x=2023, xend=2024, y=8.9,yend=8.9),colour="grey34",

# linewidth=1.5) +

geom\_point(aes(x=2024, y=8.95),colour=colPalette[5],

size=3,shape=15) +

#Alberta

#geom\_point(aes(x=2024,y=9.91),colour=colPalette[6],size=3,shape=15)+

geom\_point(aes(x=2024,y=9.43),colour=colPalette[6],size=3,shape=15)+

#BC

#geom\_point(aes(x=2024,y=10.31),colour=colPalette[7],size=3,shape=15)+

geom\_point(aes(x=2024,y=10.28),colour=colPalette[7],size=3,shape=15)+

geom\_point(aes(x=2017,y=2.5),color=colPalette[5],shape=15,size=2)+

annotate(geom="text",label="LEI as submitted",x=2018.75,y=2.50,

size=3.5)+

geom\_point(aes(x=2017,y=2.0),color=colPalette[6],shape=15,size=2)+

annotate(geom="text",label="Alberta 2024 Re-levered",x=2019.175,y=2.0,

size=3.5)+

geom\_point(aes(x=2017,y=1.5),color=colPalette[7],shape=15,size=2)+

annotate(geom="text",label="British Columbia 2024 Re-levered",x=2019.75,y=1.5,

size=3.5)+

# ggtitle(label="Authorized Equity Returns: US, Selected US States, Ontario

# Adjusted for Leverage & Taxes")+

theme(plot.title=element\_text(hjust=.5,face="bold",colour="grey34"),

legend.position="bottom",

legend.title=element\_blank())

#axis.text.x=element\_blank(),

# axis.title.y=element\_text(colour="grey34"))

# Data to export for Excel

#roe1\_yr\_wide<-roe1\_yr%>%

# filter(state %in% c("CA","MA","NY","Ontario"))%>%

# pivot\_wider(names\_from="state",values\_from="ROEAdj",id\_cols="yr")

#write\_csv(roe1\_yr\_wide,file=paste(rawDir,"ny\_ma\_AdjROE.csv"))

# Analysis of data since 2020. Response to Interrogatory M3-10-OEB Staff-42

roe\_2021<-roe1\_yr%>%

filter(yr>=2020)%>%

filter(ROEAdj>=11.08)%>%

group\_by(state)%>%

summarize(N=n(),

avgAuth=mean(ROEAdj,na.rm=TRUE))

# Table of ROEAdj for (1) All US (avg); (2) CA,NY,MA; (3) ontario

# average by year.

us\_by\_yr<-roe1\_yr%>%

filter(state!="Ontario")%>%

group\_by(yr)%>%

summarise(avgROEUS=mean(ROEAdj,na.rm=TRUE))

ca\_by\_yr<-roe1\_yr%>%

filter(state=="Ontario")%>%

group\_by(yr)%>%

summarise(avgROECA=mean(ROEAdj,na.rm=TRUE))

comps\_by\_yr<-roe1\_yr%>%

filter(state %in% c("NY","MA","CA"))%>%

select(yr,state,ROEAdj)%>%

pivot\_wider(id\_cols=yr,names\_from="state",values\_from="ROEAdj")

avgROE<-us\_by\_yr%>%

left\_join(comps\_by\_yr,by="yr")%>%

left\_join(ca\_by\_yr,by="yr")

#write\_csv(avgROE,file=paste(rawDir,"avgROEAdj.csv",sep="/"))